Re Alleged Installation *of surveillance cameras inside R. S. Chamber*

और लेखे, लेखाओं पर लेखापरीक्षा प्रतिवेदन सहित ।

(ii) उपर्युक्त प्रतिवेदन को स्वीकार करते हुए सरकार द्वारा विवरण ।

(iii) ऊपर (i) में उल्लिखित पत्रों को सभा पटल पर रखने में हुए विलम्ब के कारणों को दर्शाने वाला विवरण ।

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI PABAN SINGH GHATOWAR): Madam, I lay on the Table a copy each (in English and Hindi) of the following papers :—

(i) Annual Report of the Central Council for Research in Ayurveda and Siddha, New Delhi, for the year 1991-92.

(ii) Annual Accounts of the Central Council for Research in Ayurveda and Siddha, New Delhi, for the year 1990-91 and the Audit Report thereon.

(iii) Statement giving reasons for the delay in laying the papers mentioned at (i) and (ii) above.

[Placed in Library. *See* No. L.T. 4484/93]

PRESENTATION OF THE REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENT ASSURANCES

डा० बापू काळदाते (महाराष्ट्र) : मैं सरकारी आश्वासनों संबंधी समिति का उनतालीसवां प्रतिवेदन (अंग्रेजी तथा हिन्दी में) प्रस्तुत करता हूं ।

REPORT OF THE RAILWAY CONVENTION COMMITTEE

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, I lay on the Table a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Fourth Report of the Railway Convention Committee on 'System of Railway Purchases and Contracts: Acquisition of Stores and Printing: Disposal of Scrap: Coal and Coal-ash', and Minutes of the sittings of the Committee relating thereto.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we will take up Calling Attention matter.

Realleged installation of surveillance cameras inside Rajya Sabha Chamber

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): No, Madam, I want to raise a matter which concerns the privilege of Members of Parliament.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is the privilege?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, the issue of privilege is the other day a question. . .(*Interruptions*). .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I want to hear what privilege matter he is raising. . .(*Interruptions*). . .Shankar Dayalji, if you want to talk, please go out in the Lobby and talk. Please don't make the House a Lobby. I have to deal with the privilege matter.

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH (Bihar): I am sorry, Madam.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, the other day an issue was raised regarding surveillance which was being maintained by the Government at my residence. Members cutting across party lines had spoken on that occasion.

An issue was raised by the Congress Member, Mr. Ahluwalia, who is not present here today, about surveillance within the Parliament building. Now I am rising today to raise this question. I find that within this House we are under surveillance. You look at that camera. Look at that camera here. Both these are closed circuit television cameras which have been installed in this House. . .(*Interruptions*). . .Yes, two cameras there. I have seen that within the Central Hall also these closed circuit television cameras have been installed. I am told that they have put up a head office or headquarters of this in the basement of the Parliament House where some cops are going to keep a constant vigil on what the Members of Parliament are doing inside this House, inside the other House and in the Central Hall. . .(*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Shame, shame.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): This is really a very serious matter.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: When we decided that we shall open the proceedings of this House and the other House in regard to the

Question Hour to the T. V. of this country. I remember we went through a long process of discussion. The General Purposes Committees of the two Houses met separately. Then, we had a joint meeting of General Purposes Committees of the two Houses and then we had decided that we shall permit the installation of television cameras in this House to record what was happening in this House during the Question Hour. Even then we took precaution that the Chairman would look at it and he will look at the record and then this would be shown on the T. V. Now, I feel today, absolutely unclean degraded as a Members of Parliament that, sitting in this House, sitting in the Central Hall, we are being constantly watched by some cop or the other. Is this what this Parliament has been reduced to? I have been around this place for long. I remember the easy atmosphere where we could go and meet anyone. Now, who is doing this? I would like to know this. Has the General Purposes Committee of this House been consulted? Who has permitted the installation of these closed circuit television cameras? Who has allowed this? Madam Deputy Chairman, I am wanting to know this from you as the Presiding Officer of this House. Have you permitted the installation of closed circuit television cameras here? Why has this matter not been discussed with the General Purposes Committee, with leaders of... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Are we living in a Nazi State? What is all this? It is really a very serious matter.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): On whose authority have these cameras been installed?

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Have they secured the permission of the Speaker or the Chairman of this House?

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Whatever happens here can only be on the authority of the Chairman or in consultation with all the party leaders. There had been no consultation with party leaders; there had been no meeting with the Chairman. There had been originally a meeting with the Chairman of the General Purposes Committee... *(Interruptions)*... We want to know it very clearly as to on whose authority these monitoring instruments have been put here and on whose authority they have been put in the Central Hall. Many Members may not feel happy to go and meet others as they like because there may be some restraint because somebody may be watching. A member of the ruling party may like to talk to an Opposition Member, but he may not go and talk to him because he may be watched by ruling party people. The freedom of Members is being curtailed. I want you to take up this matter ... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I would be happy if you are brief. We have the call-attention matter.

SHRI M. A. BABY (Kerala): Now, we are calling the attention of the Government. Without taking a final decision on this, no other proceedings will go on.

विपक्ष के नेता (श्री सिकन्दर बख्त): सदर साहिबा, मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि कुछ अरसे पहले यहां पर एक शोर था कि पार्लियामेंट के अंदर सिक्योरिटी का बंदोबस्त किया जाएगा। मैं चाहता हूं कि सरकार यह बताए कि क्या यह सिर्फ सिक्योरिटी का बंदोबस्त है या यह सरवेलेंस के लिए लगाए गए हैं? अगर यह मेंबर्स के सरवेलेंस के लिए लगाए गए हैं तो मैं इसकी निन्दा करना चाहता हूं और अगर सिक्योरिटी के लिए लगाए गए हैं तो सिक्योरिटी की बात को लेकर कहां तक सरकार जा सकती है, क्योंकि यह सैंट्रल हॉल वगैरह-वगैरह तक में लगे हुए हैं। तो जरा उसकी तफसील सरकार की तरफ से आनी चाहिए।†

شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ۔ میں یہ کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ کچھ عرصہ پہلے یہاں پر ایک شور تھا کہ پارلیمنٹ کے اندر سیکیورٹی کا بندوبست کیا جائے گا۔ میں چاہتا ہوں کہ یہ سرکار یہ بتائے کہ کیا یہ صرف سیکیورٹی کا بندوبست ہے یا یہ سرویلینس کے لیے لگائے گئے ہیں۔ اگر یہ ممبرس کے سرویلینس کے لیے لگائے گئے ہیں تو میں اس کی نندا کرنا چاہتا ہوں۔ اور اگر سیکیورٹی کے لیے لگائے گئے ہیں تو سیکیورٹی کی بات کرکے کہاں تک سرکار جا سکتی ہے۔ کیونکہ وہ سنٹرل ہال وغیرہ وغیرہ تک میں لگے ہوئے ہیں، تو ذرا اس کی تفصیل سرکار کی طرف سے آنی چاہیے۔

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Madam, there cannot be two views on the undesirability of surveillance. I am sure Members on all sides of the House would share the same perspective on this question. The real question is whether the facts as narrated by our senior colleague, Mr. Sinha, are true. Since the Government has not come forward to contradict the facts, one is constrained to believe that the facts are confirmed. Why is the Government silent? Are these happening without the knowledge of the Government? What exactly are the facts? Will you, therefore, kindly direct the Government to react to the nature of the facts? . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM : Have they taken the permissioln of the Chairman or the Speaker?. . . *(Interruptions)* . . . this is really a serious matter.

डा० मुरली मनोहर जोशी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदय! यह आपका और स्पीकर महोदय का ही अधिकार है कि जो यहां इस बात का फैसला करे। सरकार को यह हक नहीं दिया जा सकता कि वह सिक्योरिटी के नाम पर बिना हक के और बिना जनरल परपजेज कमेटी की राय के किसी किस्म का कोई इंस्ट्रूमेंट यहां लगा सके। यह सरकार की प्रोपर्टी नहीं है।

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Benagal) : Madam, I would like to know whether these cameras have been installed with the permission of the Chairman. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I would like to know whether it has been done with the sanction of the Chairman or not,. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI G. G. SWELL (Meghalaya) : Madam, there seems to be a Big Brother, operating from somewhere, without the knowledge of the Chairman, and without the consent of the House,. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, I would like to know whether it enjoys your sanction or not. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I would like to know whether the Chairman has permitted it or not. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Madam, my specific point is, have these cameras been installed with the permission of the Chairman, with the approval of the Chair or is it a measure undertaken by the executive behind your back? I would like to know this thing from you. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONAL PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA : Madam, I want to make a submission but they are not allowing me to do so. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will call you. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) : Madam, I wish to say only one thing in addition to what my colleagues have spoken. There are legitimate requirements of security which none of us from this side ever opposed. Outside the precincts of Parliament House, police have always run amuck and even MPs have had reasons to complain. But the executive can claim that they are looking after law and order. In the precincts of Parliament House, it is well established that only the Speaker's writ runs. Within the Chamber of Rajya Sabha, the sanctum sanctorm of Rajya Sabha, nothing can be done without the permission of the Chairman of Rajya Sabha. We have a Special Committee—— the General Purposes Committee—— and the whole purpose of that Committee is to decide on such matters. Now nobody, at all, has any authority to override this Committee. If it has been done without a reference to this Committee or without the approval of this Committee, it is a gross contempt and breach of privilege of this House—— whoever has done it—and I wish to place some facts, which is common sense. They may istall any camera anywhere.

Even from the common sense point of view, I cannot understand what security these cameras can give. Suppose, a man sitting in the basement is seeing something going wrong, what can he do? He can only watch. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I can't even do myself sitting over here. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Except surveillance, except knowing what different MPs are doing, it is serving no purpose. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let Mr. Ram Naresh Yadav say what he wants to say. Let me allow him to say something.

श्री राम नरेश यादव (उत्तर प्रदेश) : महोदया, पशवंत सिन्हा जी और अन्य सम्मानित सदस्यों ने जो प्रश्न उठाया है वह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है। सदन में इस तरह की स्थिति आती है तो बहुत दुख होता है। इसलिए सरकार को चाहिए कि इस बात को स्पष्ट करे कि ऐसा क्यों है, कैसे है, है कि नहीं?

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH (Bihar): Madam, we want to know this thing from you... *(Interruptions)*... Let the Chair say someting. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There was a question raised by the Leader of the Opposition when he said, "has the Government put it or not?" So I want the Government to explain whether they have put it or not... *(Interruptions)*. If they want to say something, why do you object? *(Interruptions)*... Let them say... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Madam, one point. ... *(Interruptions)*... we would like to know whether the Chairman has permitted any surveillance within the House or not... *(Interruptions)*... what is the decision of the Chairman?... *(Interruptions)*... We would like to know whether the hon. Chairman the House has permitted the installation of any of these instruments in this House... *(Interruptions)*... We would like to know whether they have been permitted by the Chairman ... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, मुझे एतराज है, यह तो वे कम से कम बता सकते हैं कि गवर्नमैंट का आपरेशन का तरीका क्या है?

†نیتا دروھی دل "شری سکندر بخت": صدر صاحبہ۔ مجھے اعتراض ہے۔ یہ تو وہ کم سے کم بتا سکتے ہیں کہ گورنمنٹ کا آپریشن کا طریقہ کیا ہے۔

There is no harm in hearing her... *(Interruptions)*... We must hear her... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Will you please allow me? Allow me for one minute... *(Interruptions)*... Please, I request everbody to sit down... *(Interruptions)*... Please, one minute... *(Interruptions)*... One minute... *(Interruptions)*... One minute. I have not started giving my ruling... *(Interruptions)*... please. Just a minute... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: I would like to know only one point... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One minute.

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Only one point, Madam. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will allow you. Just one minute. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Before you ask the Government to react, we would like to know whether the Chairman has permitted the installation of these instruments inside the House. *(Interruptions)*... That we would like to know. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Will you please sit down? *(Interruptions)*... The question is whether the Government is involved. Let us know that much *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Madam, the other day also the issue was raised when the Home Minister was in the House and the Home Minister had clearly denied that there had been any direction from the Government about any surveillance on anybody. *(Interruptions)*.... Let me finish. *(Interruptions)*..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let her finish *(Interruptions)*... Please let her finish.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Madam, everybody in the House Knows that no instrument and no equipment can come into the House and that nothing can be recorded here without the clearance of the Chairman and of the Committee which is consulted for this, that is, the General Purposes Committee. A decision had been taken that on alternate weeks——this week, this House and the other week the other House——Question Hour should be televised and cameras were put in. Cameras were not removed every day and brought back during the session... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: That is a different matter... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Please listen... *(Interruptions)*...

They are not removed and lights are... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Alva, just a minute... *(Interruptions)*... Mrs. Alva, one minute. *(Interruptions)*... आप बैठिये, मैं समझा देती हूं।

Just a minute... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Let me finish my answer... *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let her finish.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Madam, no equipment can come in or go out of Parlia-

ment House without the clearance of the Speaker of the Lok Sabha. Some hon. Members mentioned that there is a monitoring office somewhere and something else. I would like to say that no space in the Parliament House is allotted to anybody by the Government. It is only by the Speaker that space for anything is allotted. We have no authority. Even the offices for the Ministers have to be allotted by Speaker. Neither has the Parliamentary Affairs Minister nor has anyone of us any *locus standi*. Therefore, if there is any fear or doubt that a wrong equipment had been brought in——it should not be there——I think the matter should be discussed in the General Purposes Committee of the House or, may be, of both the Houses together under the chairmanship of the Speaker where all the matters can be clarified. Madam, it is very unfair to say that the Government has directed that all the instruments should be put in. It is not true and I categorically deny... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: We want to know whether there is any monitoring camera.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: If you have not permitted.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: They have got a monitoring camera. It is not that the TV camera alone is there.. *(Interruptions)*... Another monitoring camera is there.. *(Interruptions)*...Now we would like to know from the Minister whether there is any separate monitoring camera inside the House.. *(Interruptions)*... It is not that only the TV camera is there.. *(Interruptions)*... She said that they have got a monitoring camera ... *(Interruptions)*... This is another camera, not the usual TV camera.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: They are watching us.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: It is not the usual TV camera. The Minister has to... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: I want to know what your ruling is.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, the Government has denied it. The Government says, "Whatever is happening, is happening with the permission of the Speaker." This Chamber of Rajya Sabha is in your control. This House does not want these cameras. This decision can be taken right now. Madam, please order for removal of these cameras *(Interruptions)*...

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा: सेंट्रल हाल से भी हटाया जाय। सेंट्रल हाल पर आधा हक हमारा बनता है। हम जाते हैं, वहां बैठते हैं। वहां पर क्यों लगा रखा है? ... **(व्यवधान)** ...

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: यहां पर क्यों लगाया गया है?... **(व्यवधान)** ...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Madam, there are six cameras... *(Interruptions)*.

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: Madam, Hon. Members speak from different places ... *(Interruptions)*... There are T. V. cameras to cover them from different directions... *(Interruptions)*...

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): ऐसे कैमरे लगे हैं या नहीं लगे हैं, इसका कन्फर्मेशन और डिनाइल तो करें। यह आपकी जानकारी में है कि नहीं कि लगे हैं या नहीं लगे हैं। हमारी जानकारी यह है कि प्रधान मंत्री का गेट जो है उसके सामने दीवार के साथ वाले कमरे में लगा हुआ है। जहां प्रधान मंत्री का गेट है उसके सामने दीवार के ऊपर सारा मामला बना हुआ है। ... **(व्यवधान)** ...

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: सदर साहिबा, हैरतअंगेज यह है कि तमाम कैमरे जो लगे हुए हैं।

†شری سکندر بخت: صدر صاحبہ۔ حیرت انگیز یہ ہے کہ تمام کیمرے جو لگے ہوئے ہیں۔

They don't have anything to do with T. V. cameras. What for are these?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Please order for their removal.. *(Interruptions)*. We don't want these cameras here.. *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Madam, apart from T. V. cameras there are six separate monitoring cameras in this House.. *(Interruptions)*... I request you to call a meeting of the Business Advisory Committee.. *(Interruptions)*. Please call a meeting of the Business advisory Committee. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Madam, please order for removal of these cameras... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN (Tamil Nadu): Who is the Big Brother watching us?.. *(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down.. *(Interruptions)*... Will you please sit

† [ ] Translitcration in Arabic Script.

down ? . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SOME HON. MEMBERS : Madam, adjourn the House . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I won't adjourn the House . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I am not going to adjourn the House . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : Please call a meeting of the Business Advisory Committee . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, I seek your permission to move a formal motion . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I seek your permission. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

*उपसभापति : प्लीज बैठिये, एक मिनट । एक सैकंड बैठ जाइये । अगर कोई सरवेलेंस हो रहा होगा तो वे देख रहे होंगे कि हम क्या झगड़ा कर रहे हैं ।

will you please sit down ? . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Just a minute . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Please . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Madam, take the sense of the House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will take the sense of the House . . *(Interruptions)* . . . There are two points. Mrs. Alva has very clearly said, I mean the Government because she is speaking on behalf of the Government. . . *(Interruptions)* . . . If you keep quiet for a minute, I will be very happy. Mrs. Alva has very clearly said that it was not the Government who has installed these cameras. I am a Member of the General Purposes Committee. As far as my knowledge goes, we had a General Purposes Committee Meeting regarding televising of the proceedings during Question Hour and also at some other times when the Chairman feels that it is important. I have no knowledge about these cameras . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : Who has done it ? . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI MURASOLI MARAN : Who has done it ? . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have not done it . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I have to find out from the Chairman . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I have no knowledge about it . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I don't know about the Central Hall. I have not gone there during lunch time or . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I don't know about it. Now that this has been brought to my notice——I think there are . . 3 . . 4 . . .
(Interruptions) . . .

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : There are six cameras. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : We have six monitoring cameras. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI G. G. SWELL : Please adjourn the House until the matter is sorted out. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : It is a matter of privilege and you have to take action. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI P. UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh) : As far as my information goes, four of the six cameras are directed towards the gallery and two are directed towards the Treasury Benches. My feeling is that they want to conduct surveillance on the Treasury Benches so that they know who is talking to whom. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think one is directed towards the Chair also. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Madam, I want to know from you specifically what is the problem in your ordering that these cameras should be removed at least from the Chamber of Rajya Sabha. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will take the sense of the House. . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Just a minute. . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I do not work arbitrarily. I am not a dictator in this House. I run this House with the co-operation of the Members and according to the desires of the Members. If the Members agree, we will do it. But I do not want any formal resolution. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN : It should not only be removed, but action should be taken. We have to find out how these cameras came in and we have to take action . . . *(Interruptions)*.

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया (बिहार) : उपसभापति महोदया, यह मसला पहले भी उठा था । उस दिन हमारे सब सदस्यों ने यह सवाल उठाया था कि किन हालात में यह कैमरे लगाए गए हैं और किसने इसकी इजाज़त दी है । उपसभापति महोदया, हमारे पूर्व पुरुषों ने जब इस सदन के बारे में सारी कार्य-प्रणाली बनाई थी तो उस वक्त एक फैसला लिया था, जिसमें कहा गया था कि पार्लियामेंट कम्पलेक्स के अन्दर पुलिस नहीं आएगी । परन्तु आए दिन हम यह देखते हैं कि लोकल पुलिस पूरे पार्लियामेंट कम्पलेक्स के अन्दर दिन-प्रति-दिन भरती जा रही है । अब तो इतना कर दिया गया है कि अगर कोई एम०पी० किसी कमर्शियल व्हीकल में आ रहा है, उसके पास स्टिकर नहीं है तो उसको गेट के बाहर उतार दिया जाता है । गेट के बाहर उतार कर उसको एक फेरी कार में बैठा कर यहां लाया जाता है । कई मेम्बर्स तो पैदल ही आते हैं क्योंकि बहुत

सारे मैम्बर्स नार्थ ऐवेन्यु, पंडित पंत मार्ग जैसे नज़दीक इलाकों से पैदल ही आते हैं और वे फेरी कार का भी प्रयोग नहीं करते हैं, पैदल ही अन्दर आते हैं । मेरी समझ में अभी तक यह नहीं आया कि किन कारणों-वश ऐसा निर्णय लिया गया है और किस कमेटी ने लिया है । पार्लियामेंट को चलाने के लिए एक जनरल परपजेस कमेटी है . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . महोदया, सदन के साथ जुड़ा हुआ जो इलाका है हमारे पार्लियामेंट के इस अहाते की कार्यप्रणाली को देखने के लिए जनरल परपजेज़ कमेटी है । अगर कोई निर्णय किसी अधिकारी ने लिया जा अध्यक्ष ने लिया या उपाध्यक्ष ने लिया तो वह क्या जनरल परपजेज़ कमेटी में आया, क्या उस पर बहस हुई, चर्चा हुई ? अगर हुई तो यह आज मैम्बरों की उत्तेजना क्यों है ? मैं समझता हूं अगर आप इस चीज़ को प्रमाणित कर दें कि वाकई देश को और इस सदन को किसी बाहरी ताकत से खतरा है या कैमरे के लेंस इसे रोक सकते हैं तो हमको यह समझा दें । हो सकता है, हम भी आपसे सहमत हो जाएं । पर जब ऐसी कोई बात नहीं है, यह कैमरे कुछ रोक नहीं सकते है, बनिस्बत कुछ उल्टा कर सकते हैं तो इन कैमरों के द्वारा क्या हमारे ऊपर निगरानी रखी जा रही है ? इन कैमरों से किस पर निगरानी रखी जाती है । इसका औचित्य हमें समझा दें कि इसलिए यह हमारे ऊपर कैमरे लगाए गए हैं । तो एक तरह यह मेम्बर्स पर . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . धवन जी मैं खत्म कर लूं । क्योंकि हमारे यहां पर जो टी॰ वी॰ की रिकार्डिंग होती है कन्वेइंचन आफर में यह भी सेंसर की जाती है । जब यह टेलीकास्ट किया जाता है तो बाकायदा सेंसर करके किया जाता है । ये कैमरे तो बिना सेंसर किये हमें इन्फारमेशन दे रहे हैं । आखिर किन मजबूरियों के कारण ऐसा किया गया है । जब तक यह पता नहीं लगता तब तक मैं इन कैमरों का विरोध करता हूं । ये कैमरे हटने चाहिए । अगर आपको सदन की और इस सदन की प्रापर्टी की रक्षा करने के लिए कुछ व्यवस्था करनी है तो हमारे पूर्व पुरुषों ने—जिन्होंने भारत का संविधान बनाया, जिन्होंने भारतीय सदन की कार्यप्रणाली तैयार की, उन्होंने ऐसे सोच के बाद जो चीजें बनाई थीं उन पर पुनर्विचार करके एक बलिष्ठ कानून बनायें, पर पुलिस के हाथ पूरा सदन नहीं सौंपा जाए । यह बर्दाश्त नहीं होगा ।

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा । एक मिनट मैं कहना चाहता हूं । एक इम्पार्टेंट बात करना चाहता हूं ।

نیتاورودھی دل "شری سکندر بخت": مدرصاحبہ ایک منٹ میں کہنا چاہتا ہوں۔ ایک امپورٹنٹ بات کرنا چاہتا ہوں۔

उपसभापति : धवन साहब कह दें फिर मैं आपको दूंगी । I will definitely call you.

श्री आर॰ के॰ धवन (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : इस बारे में कोई दो राय नहीं है कि सदन में जो भी कुछ कार्यवाही की जाए, कैमरे लगाये जाएं या कुछ लगाया जाए, जो कुछ इसकी कमेटी बनी हुई है बिजिनेस वगैरह की, जो भी कमेटी है उसे पूछताछ करके होनी चाहिए और सरवेलेंस नहीं होनी चाहिए । लेकिन अहलुवालिया जी की यह बात सुनकर मुझे आपत्ति हुई—वे कहते हैं कि जब पूर्वजों ने संविधान बनाया था तो इसके बारे में उन्होंने जो कानून बनाये थे, नियम बनाये थे उनको ध्यान में रखना चाहिए । उस वक्त सिक्योरिटी आस्पेक्ट्स क्या थे कंट्री के, देश में उस समय क्या हालात थे . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया : देश के हालात ऐसे थे कि 1947 में देश का विभाजन हुआ और महात्मा गांधी मारे गये । इससे ज्यादा बदतर हालात थे . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

श्री आर॰ के॰ धवन : He has to allow me to speak.

देखिए अहलुवालिया जी अगर ऊंची आवाज में बोल करके . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . मेरी आवाज को दबाना चाहते हैं तो मैं भी ऊंचा बोल सकता हूं । लेकिन मेरी आदत नहीं है । जो आपको कन्वे करना है वह धीरे से भी कन्वे किया जा सकता है ।

तो यह कहना कि फेरी से लोगों को क्यों लाया जाता है, क्या यह सदन इस बात की गारंटी देने को तैयार है कि कल कोई गलत व्हीकिल अगर पार्लियामेंट में आ गयी या कोई बम विस्फोट हो गया—वे आने दें तो कोई कार्यवाही नहीं की जाएगी, सरकार के ऊपर कोई आरोप नहीं लगाया जाएगा । तो मैं इसके साथ सहमत हूं । यह सिक्योरिटी रीजन है । यह कहना चाहिए कि कैमरे यहां नहीं होने चाहिए । यह बिल्कुल सही बात है । लेकिन यह कहना कि यहां मेम्बर्स को चलकर आना पड़ता है, तो यह गवर्नमेंट ने सुविधा दी है, फेरी लगायी है । कल को आप यह भी कह देंगे कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर हाउस में ऐसे लोगों को क्यों नहीं ले जाया जाता है । जब तक इंदिराजी प्राइम मिनिस्टर थीं कभी कोई फेरी सिस्टम नहीं था । आप लोगों ने, हम लोगों ने सिक्योरिटी की दृष्टि से, जो इनसिक्योरिटी पैदा हो गयी थी मुल्क में उसको देखकर, ऐसे हालात को देखकर यह किया कि यहां पर भी फेरी सिस्टम लागू किया जाए । इसलिए यहां यह फेरी सिस्टम चालू किया गया है तो इसमें क्या हर्ज है । आप यह बात जरूर उठाये कि ये कैमरे नहीं होने चाहिए, सर्वीलेंस नहीं होना चाहिए । इसमें कोई दो राय नहीं है . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . लेकिन यह कहना कि सिक्योरिटी की कोई सुविधा न दी जाए इससे मैं बिल्कुल सहमत नहीं हूं । या यह हाउस, सदन पास कर दे, रिजोल्यूशन मूव कर दे कि कल को कोई विस्फोट हो गया तो सरकार जिम्मेवार नहीं होगी . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . तो कह सकते हैं . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री एस॰ एस॰ अहलुवालिया : महोदया, मैंने कभी नहीं कहा कि सिक्योरिटी की व्यवस्था न हो । मैंने यह कहा कि

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

दिल्ली पुलिस के तत्वधान में यहां सिक्योरिटी व्यवस्था नहीं होनी चाहिए । यह सदन फैसला करे । अगर आपको कमांडो फोर्स चाहिए तो यह पार्लियामेंट की फोर्स होगी । अगर आपको ब्लैक कैट चाहिए तो यह पार्लियामेंट की फोर्स होगी । आप आपनी एक सेपरेट फोर्स रखें और यह सिक्योरिटी की व्यवस्था करे . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

श्री आर० के० धवन (आन्ध्र प्रदेश) : . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . खाली छोड़ दीजिए । यह क्या बात करते हैं आप . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA: The security aspect is decide by the Speaker and not by anybody else. There was a meeting in the Speaker's office and the Speaker has approved the security arrangement. . . *(Interruptions)* . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I don't want any more discussion. . . *(Interruptions)*. I am not allowing any more discussion. . . *(Interruptions)* will you please sit down. Mr. Ahluwalia.

श्री एस० एस० अहलुवालिया : अभी मैं सदन को यह बताना चाहता हूं . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . धवन जी ने एक बात मेरा नाम लेकर कही है । मैं जवाब देना चाहता हूं । दो बातें सीधी हैं । अवस्था के बारे में बात की है । 1947 में इस देश का बंटवारा हुआ और महात्मा गांधी की हत्या हुई . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . एक सीरियस मसला था देश में और उसके पहले आज तक इस सदन में बम नहीं फटा, पर भगत सिंह, सुखदेव, राजगुरू ने यहीं पर बम फेंका था । सुरक्षा की व्यवस्था पूर्व पुरूषों ने क्यों की । ऐसी बात नहीं है । क्या बात करते हैं ।

उपसभापति : एक मिनट प्लीज . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I want to put an end to it because we have other business today. Whatever security measures have to be taken outside the Chamber, it is for you to decide. To me, the Chamber is the most important thing. I am concerned with the Chamber. If the House so agrees. . . *(Interruptions)* . . . I don't know what happened.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : डिप्टी चेयरमैन साहिबा, आई एम सारी, एक बहुत अहम बात है इस मसले में . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . मालवीय जी, मुझे आधा मिनट दीजिए, मैं बैठ जाऊंगा ।

मैंने शुरू में अर्ज किया था कि पहले तो हमें यह मालूम होना चाहिए कि कैमरे किस मकसद के लिए लगाये हैं ?

شری سکندر بخت : ڈپٹی چیرمین صاحبہ۔ آئی

ایم ساری۔ ایک بہت اہم بات ہے اس مسئلے میں . . . "مداخلت" مالویہ جی مجھے آدھا منٹ دیجیے گا میں بیٹھ جاؤں گا۔

میں شروع میں عرض کیا تھا کہ پہلے تو ہمیں یہ معلوم ہونا چاہیے کہ کیمرے کس مقصد کے لیے لگائے ہیں۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I don't know.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : जस्ट ए मिनट । मैं यह अर्ज करना चाहता हूं कि इससे पहले कि हम किसी आखिरी नतीजे पर पहुंचे, पहले वाक्यात तफसील के साथ मालूम होने चाहिएं, जो अभी तक हमारे सामने नहीं आये हैं । वाक्यात बताइये क्या है, क्यों हैं ? यह कैमराज़ किसकी मंजूरी से लगे हैं, किस मकसद के लिए लगे हैं, यह वाक्यात आने के बाद फिर सदन में कोई फैसला करें ।

شری سکندر بخت : جسٹ اے منٹ۔ میں یہ عرض کرنا چاہتا ہوں کہ اس سے پہلے کہ ہم کسی آخری نتیجہ پر پہنچیں۔ پہلے واقعات تفصیل کے ساتھ معلوم ہونے چاہیں۔ جو ابھی تک ہمارے سامنے نہیں آئے ہیں۔ واقعات بتائیے کیا ہیں۔ کیوں ہیں۔ یہ کیمرا کس کی منظوری سے لگے ہیں۔ کس مقصد کے لیے لگے ہیں۔ یہ واقعات آنے کے بعد پھر سدن میں کوئی فیصلہ کریں۔

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I will inform the Chairman about everything that has happened in the House. As far as cameras are concerned, at least the General Purposes Committee did not approve. I will ask the Chairman. In the past also, on any matter concerning the House, no Chairman of the General Purposes Committee has ever taken any decision arbitrarily. Whether it is the present Chairman or the

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

Chairmen in the past, they have always called a General Purposes Committee meeting and taken a decision and informed the House about its decision. Within my knowledge, I don't know whether a General Purposes Committee meeting took place or a decision was taken about these small cameras by it. I don't know for what purpose they are put. I have no knowledge whether they are put for security reasons or how they are put. I will convey to the hon. Chairman the complete sentiments of the Members. Now let us go ahead with other business.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Who is responsible for putting these cameras? On the one hand, the Government says it has no knowledge and, on the other hand, you say you don't have any knowledge of it. Then, how these cameras came? That has to be examined. Who is responsible? How these cameras came? You are saying you have no knowledge of it? Then, how these cameras came? Who put them there? That has to be examined.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have understood the sense of the House. The sense of the House is that cameras should not be there. That is what I understood. If there is any other sense of the House, let me know.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Not only that, those who put these cameras should also be punished.

श्री सैय्यद सिब्ते रज़ी (उत्तर प्रदेश): मेरा सजेशन यह है, जैसा अभी आपने कहा . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If everybody starts speaking at the same time, how can I hear you.

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra): You adjourn the House . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I am not going to adjourn the House.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Madam, I am on a point of order. One minute.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Cameras or no cameras, we have to work.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no, we cannot work.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Madam, we will not work under cameras. As long as cameras are there, we won't work.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Will you just keep quiet . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI PRAKASH YASHWANT AMBEDKAR: You give a ruling that cameras should be removed.

श्री सैय्यद सिब्ते रज़ी: जैसा अभी आपने कहा कि इस मामले को जनरल परपजेज़ कमेटी को देखना चाहिए था और अगर यह कैमरे . . . **(व्यवधान)** यह कैमरे क्या एफ०आई०-ए० ने या सी०आई०ए० ने लगाये हैं . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

†شری سیّد سبطِ رضی: جیسا ابھی آپ نے کہا کہ اس معاملے کو جنرل پرپزز کمیٹی کو دیکھنا چاہیے تھا اور اگر یہ کیمرے . . . "مداخلت" یہ کیمرے کیا ایف۔آئی۔اے نے یا سی۔آئی ڈی نے لگائے ہیں . . . "مداخلت"

श्री प्रमोद महाजन (महाराष्ट्र): यह जवाब देने के लिए नहीं है कि यह किसने लगाये हैं।

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह: यह कैमरा है या गन है या तोप है, पता तो लगे। . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . यह किसने लगवाया है, इसकी इन्क्वायरी कौन करेगा? . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

SHRI E. BALANANDAN (Kerala): Madam, there is one point . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI (Gujarat): Who has put it there? . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN: Madam, we want to know . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If everybody speaks at the same time, it is very difficult for me to hear anybody . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Please sit down . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . *Kisne kiya*, I have no idea . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

. . . बैठिए। मुझे बिल्कुल नहीं मालूम है। मुझे नहीं मालूम है कि किसने लगाया। प्लीज़, आप बैठिए। . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

श्री मोहम्मद अफज़ल उर्फ शीश अफज़ल (उत्तर प्रदेश): इसकी इन्क्वायरी होनी चाहिए। आपको नहीं मालूम, सरकार को नहीं मालूम, किसी को पता नहीं। कल को यहां पर कुछ भी लगा देंगे।

†شری محمد افضل عرف م۔ افضل: اس کی انکوائری ہونی چاہیے۔ آپ کو نہیں معلوم۔

† [ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

سرکار کو نہیں معلوم۔ کسی کو پتہ نہیں۔ کل کو یہاں پر کچھ بھی لگا دیں گے۔

उपसभापति : बैठिए, बैठ जाइये । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

I said and I repeat that I will speak to the Chairman and tell the Chairman . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . Just a minute please . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . Unless and until the General Purposes Committee meeting takes place and takes a decision and the Chairman takes a decision, we are not going to have it . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I do not know if they are working . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . But, if the cameras are there, they should not be functioning. This much I can tell . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I will give this information . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . Please sit down . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

बैठ जाइये । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . आप बैठिए, प्लीज़ । **(व्यवधान)** . . .

I can tell the Secretariat to take care of it and unless and until a proper decision is taken by the House, nothing can be done . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: How can you know whether it is working or not? . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I do not know who has put it and so, whom should I ask? . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, if nobody knows anything about it, the cameras can be removed . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can give my orders. But I must know who has put it there . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I can only tell my Secretariat to see that they should not be working. That much I can do . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: The Secretariat knows it. Without the knowledge of the Secretariat, how can it be put there? . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Let us go ahead with our business . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . We are now going ahead with the work . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: Madam, there should be an inquiry as to who the persons are who are responsible for this and what the agency is which has installed the camera inside the House . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will find out . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: We want an inquiry . . . (*Interruptions*). You have to assure us . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . You kindly assure us . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI MOHAMMED AFZAL *alias* MEEM AFZAL: It must be the CIA. Will the Government inquire into it? . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I am not allowing anything . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I am not permitting anything . . . (*Interruptions*) . . . I am not allowing anything, not a word, on this . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम (पश्चिमी बंगाल) : आपको मालूम होना चाहिए क्या है ? . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

شری محمد سلیم: آپ کو معلوم ہونا چاہیے کیا ہے۔ ... "مداخلت"

उपसभापति : आप बैठिए । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम : आप बताइये । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

شری محمد سلیم: آپ بتلایئے۔۔۔"مداخلت"

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I cannot say anything at all. I can only discuss the matter with the Chairman . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

श्री दिग्विजय सिंह : यह यशवंत सिन्हा ने चार्ज लगाया है यह मोनिटर हो रहा है इसमें से । आप सेक्रेटेरिएट से यह पूछिए कि मोनिटर हो रहा है या नहीं हो रहा है । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . . यह चार्ज लगाया गया है । यह सेक्रेटेरिएट से पूछकर हमें बताइये । उसको रुकवाइये किसी को भेजिए और उसको रुकवाइये । . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, the Marshal of the House should be asked to disconnect the wire . . . (*Interruptions*) . . .

श्री नारायण प्रसाद गुप्ता (मध्य प्रदेश) : यह लगाया किसने है ? . . . **(व्यवधान)** . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am asking the Secretariat officials to go and find out (*Interruptions*) . . .

---

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic Script.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Madam, we want to know whether it has been done with the knowledge of the Secretariat or without the knowledge of the Secretariat ... *(Interruptions)*

श्री प्रमोद महाजन: मैडम, इतने दिन हमको ....**(व्यवधान)** ... एक दिन से कोई फर्क नहीं पड़ेगा कल 12 बजे ...**(व्यवधान)** ...

उपसभापति: बोलिए, अब वह टूटने गए हैं कि हो रही है कि नहीं हो रही है।

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Is it happening without the knowledge of the Secretary-General or with the knowledge of the Secretary-General? That is what we want to know. ... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have asked ... *(Interruptions)* ... Mr. Afzal, please sit down. I have asked a senior member from the Secretariat, the Additional Secretary to find out about the allegation by Mr. Yashwant Sinha and others that it is being recorded and surveillance is going on somewhere in the precincts or around the precincts of the Parliament. As soon as I get the information, I will inform the House. Now, let us go ahead with the Calling Attention.

SHRI M. A. BABY: Meanwhile, please direct ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Direct whom?

SHRI M. A. BABY: ... that the connections will be removed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Baby, you are talking of something. If I am not aware as to who has put it, who shall I direct? I do not know the hiring party. I can do the firing. ... *(Interruptions)* ...

SHRI M. A. BABY: The wiring connections should be removed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not an electrician. ... *(Interruptions)* ...

आप बैठ जाइए।

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय (उत्तर प्रदेश): मैडम, मैं आज के ऑर्डर पेपर के बारे में जानकारी चाहता हूं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Can I have a little peace in the House? Order, please.

श्री सत्य प्रकाश मालवीय: मैडम, आज के इस ऑर्डर पेपर में डंकल प्रस्तावों के सिलसिले में एक सरकारी प्रस्ताव है, लेकिन सबसे पहले इसमें एक ध्यानाकर्षण प्रस्ताव है। उसके बाद एक संविधान संशोधन है। फिर कश्मीर के सिलसिले में जो विधेयक है, उसके लिए तीन घंटे का समय दिया गया है। उसके बाद तेल और प्राकृतिक गैस आयोग का विधेयक है, उस पर चर्चा होगी। उसके बाद पावर मिनिस्ट्री का साल्वे साहब का एक प्रस्ताव है और फिर डंकल प्रस्ताव है। तो डंकल प्रस्ताव के सिलसिले में जोकि न हमारे किसानों के हित में है और न देश हित में है बल्कि विदेशी बहुराष्ट्रीय कंपनियों के दबाव में आकर यह काम हो रहा है, तो पिछला जो सत्र था, उसमें भी मांग उठायी गयी थी और उसके पहले भी मांग उठायी गयी थी। पिछले सत्र के अंतिम दिन का जो ऑर्डर पेपर था उसमें डंकल प्रस्ताव विचार के लिए रखा गया था, लेकिन वह विचार उस समय नहीं हो पाया था। तो मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि यह ऑर्डर पेपर में तो आ गया है, लेकिन डंकल प्रस्ताव पर चर्चा होगी कि नहीं क्योंकि आज जितना बिजनेस है, उसके हिसाब में जानना चाहता हूं कि इस पर चर्चा होगी कि नहीं? फिर कल शुक्रवार है और प्रायवेट मेंबर्स का दिन है, तो मैं केवल इतना ही जानना चाहता था कि डंकल प्रस्ताव पर चर्चा होगी या नहीं क्योंकि पिछले सत्र में भी यह आया था और चर्चा नहीं हो पायी थी?

उपसभापति: मालवीय जी, हमारी तरफ से तो हम कोशिश करेंगे कि जो भी बिजनेस लिस्ट है, सब विषयों पर चर्चा हो। आज हम यह कोशिश कर रहे थे, कल भी हमने आप लोगों की मदद से लंच आवर में छुट्टी नहीं की और डिस्कसन हो गया। मैंने इसीलिए लीडर्स की मीटिंग बुलायी थी आज सुबह डिस्कस करने को और अब मैं हाउस के सामने यह बात रखना चाह रही हूं क्योंकि हमारे सामने दो बहुत महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दे हैं जिन पर कि हमें वोटिंग करनी है। एक कांस्टीट्यूशन अमेंडमेंट 77वां है जिसमें के 2/3 मेजोरिटी होनी जरूरी है और उसके अलावा कश्मीर के मसले पर बहस होनी है 3 घंटे और उसके ऊपर वोटिंग होनी है, सिंपल मेजोरिटी से उसको पास कर के भेजना है। फिर एक दूसरा आर्डिनेंस है ऑइल एंड नेचुरल गैस का, वह हमें क्लियर करना है। आज हमारे सामने कॉलिंग अटेंशन भी है, तो अगर आज हम लंच आवर न करें और कालिंग अटेंशन में कोशिश करें, अब तो काफी समय बीत गया, अगर ढाई बजे तक हम कॉलिंग अटेंशन को कम्प्लीट कर लें अपनी स्पीच को पॉइंटेड रखकर तो मैं समझती हूं कि ढाई और तीन बजे के बीच में हम जो 77वां अमेंडमेंट है और मैं 77वें अमेंडमेंट के बारे में एक बात मेंबर्स के सामने कहना चाहती हूं कि यह 77वां अमेंडमेंट सिर्फ सरकार को यह अनुमति देगा कि कांस्टीट्यूशन में उसका प्रावधान किया जाए, उसको जगह मिले मगर इसके लिए इस विषय में .... Whatever law has to be enacted, again the Government will have to come before the House to discuss it. And I expect and I request the Members that as the Government is again going to come back after we have passed this Seventy-seventh Amendment for enacting a law, at that particular point of time, the Members can give their views. If the

Members so agree, at that point of time, according to our principle, it can go to the Standing Committee for appraisal. If the Members so agree, we may not have any discussion on the Constitution (Seventy-seventh Amendment) Bill, 1992.

SHRI SIKANDER BAKHT: It is perfectly all right.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): I want to make one thing clear. What the Constitution Amendment Bill seeks to do is to add an item to article 323B as "(h) rent, its regulation and control . . ." and when the rent tribunals are constituted by virtue of power given under this provision, they will be under State laws. We should not assume that there will be a Central law which will come to us. We should not assume it at all.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you like to discuss it now, I have no objection.

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE: This is non-controversial. Why don't we pass it just now?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We cannot pass it now because we need two-thirds majority. We cannot pass it by a simple majority. And I have to ask the Chairman also to be here. I am only taking the view of the House. After the Seventy-seventh Amendment, we will go ahead with the discussion on Kashmir and as the time permits, we may discuss Dunkel also. Shall we now go ahead with the calling attention?

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA (Gujarat): Madam, without permission also somebody can raise a question of privilege. I have a very important question of privilege involving the dignity of this House. We have been discussing about Narmada. Yesterday four Members made a special mention on it. Thrice the Minister of Irrigation went to the Lok Sabha to clarify his stand. But he does not come to this House. This is lowering the dignity of this House. Therefore, I think, he should be called for a minute or two. I do not want of more of his time to be taken. But this is not the right treatment. Let him come only for two minutes. We are not asking questions. Let him come. He can go through our speeches. Therefore, it is necessary that the dignity of this House should not be lowered. This has happened on other occasions also. I do not want to raise those issues. But kindly request Shuklaji to come and clarify his stand within two minutes because I was hoping that he would come today. Yesterday I was thinking that Dr. Abrar Ahmed might convey to him, I do not know what has happened.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In any case he has got his Question Hour and he will come.

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त : सदर साहिबा, मैं यह कहना चाह रहा हूँ, यही बात है कि इस हाउस को इग्नोर किया जाता है । इस चीज को लेना चाहिए, बकायदा कल लिस्ट आफ बिजनेस में आना चाहिए और विद्याचरण शुक्ल जी को यहां पर आकर बयान देना चाहिए । मेहता साहब का जो मुतालबा है, कल लिस्ट आफ बिजनेस में रखा जाए, उसको लिया जाए । आज का जैसा आपने कहा है, वह ठीक है बिल्कुल ।

†شری سکندر بخت : صدر صاحبہ۔ میں یہ کہنا چاہ رہا تھا۔ وہی بات ہے کہ اس ہاؤس کو اگنور کیا جاتا ہے۔ اس چیز کو لینا چاہیے۔ باقاعدہ کل لسٹ آف بزنس میں آنا چاہیے اور ودیا چرن شکل کو یہاں پر آکر بیان دینا چاہیے۔ مہتا صاحب کا جو مطالبہ ہے۔ کل لسٹ آف بزنس میں رکھا جائے اس کو لیا جائے۔ آج کا جیسا آپ نے کہا ہے۔ وہ ٹھیک ہے بالکل۔

CALLING ATTENTION TO A MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

Urgent need for Government to undertake measures for the revival of sick Public Sector Undertakings

उपसभापति : ठीक है, आप बता दीजिएगा

श्री अबराए अहमद (Rajasthan): जी

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now we take up calling attention. Shri Gurudas Das Gupta.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Madam, I call the attention of the Minister of Industry to the urgent need for Government to undertake measures for the revival of sick Public Sector Undertakings.

†[ ] Translitiration in Arabic Script]